

# COMPARING FUTURES

## FOR THE SACRAMENTO–SAN JOAQUIN DELTA

JAY LUND | ELLEN HANAK | WILLIAM FLEENOR  
WILLIAM BENNETT | RICHARD HOWITT  
JEFFREY MOUNT | PETER MOYLE

2008

Supported with funding from  
Stephen D. Bechtel Jr. and the David and Lucile Packard Foundation



**PPIC**

PUBLIC POLICY  
INSTITUTE OF CALIFORNIA

ISBN: 978-1-58213-130-6

Copyright © 2008 by Public Policy Institute of California  
All rights reserved  
San Francisco, CA

Short sections of text, not to exceed three paragraphs, may be quoted without written permission provided that full attribution is given to the source and the above copyright notice is included.

PPIC does not take or support positions on any ballot measure or on any local, state, or federal legislation, nor does it endorse, support, or oppose any political parties or candidates for public office.

Research publications reflect the views of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the views of the staff, officers, or Board of Directors of the Public Policy Institute of California.

# Contents

---

Summary .....	iii
Figures .....	xxiii
Tables .....	xxv
Preface and Acknowledgments .....	xxvii
Acronyms and Abbreviations .....	xxix
Glossary: Words and Phrases .....	xxxii
1. INTRODUCTION .....	1
The <i>Envisioning Futures</i> Report .....	1
New Initiatives and New Troubles in the Delta .....	2
The <i>Comparing Futures</i> Study .....	3
2. MANAGING THE INEVITABLE .....	7
Introduction .....	7
Drivers of Change .....	8
Subsidence .....	9
Changing Inflows .....	9
Sea Level Rise .....	10
Earthquakes .....	10
Managing or Resisting Change .....	11
A Future Different from the Past .....	18
3. DELTA WATER EXPORT STRATEGIES .....	21
Exporting Through the Delta .....	23
Exporting Around the Delta .....	25
Dual Conveyance .....	26
Ending Delta Exports .....	27
Water Exports and the Delta's Economy .....	28
Evaluating the Alternatives .....	29
4. HYDRODYNAMICS AND THE SALINITY OF DELTA WATERS .....	31
Modeling Tools and Approach .....	32
Comparing Scenarios .....	33
No Exports and Unimpaired Flows .....	36
Consequences of Sea Level Rise .....	38

Consequences of Island Flooding .....	39
Consequences of Peripheral Canal Exports.....	44
Export Quantities and Canal Sizing Issues.....	45
Water Quality Implications of a Peripheral Canal .....	48
Water Quality with Sea Level Rise and a Peripheral Canal .....	48
Areas for Further Work.....	52
Sea Level Rise .....	52
Island Flooding .....	52
Water Operations .....	53
Conclusions.....	53
5. WHAT A CHANGING DELTA MEANS FOR THE ECOSYSTEM AND ITS FISHES.....	55
Basic Premises for Rebuilding the Delta Ecosystem.....	56
The Role of Habitat Diversity .....	58
Fish Species Responses to Water Export Strategies.....	58
Expert Judgments .....	59
Fish Groupings .....	60
Species Dynamics and Ecosystem Regime Shift .....	61
Hydraulic Effects on Delta Fishes.....	63
Working with Uncertainties.....	66
Attributes of an Ecosystem Solution.....	67
Planning and Regulation.....	68
Experimentation.....	68
Toxicants .....	69
Flow Patterns.....	69
Habitat Restoration .....	69
Conclusions.....	71
6. ECONOMICS OF CHANGING WATER SUPPLY AND QUALITY .....	73
Costs of Providing More Water for the Environment .....	73
Reducing or Ending Water Exports.....	76
Increasing Net Delta Outflows.....	78
The Value of New Infrastructure.....	79
Urban and Agricultural Water Quality.....	80
Drinking Water Treatment Costs .....	80
Agricultural Losses .....	80
Implications for Export Management Alternatives.....	82
Continued Through-Delta Pumping .....	82

Peripheral Canal .....	82
Dual Conveyance .....	83
No Exports .....	83
7. POLICY AND REGULATORY CHALLENGES.....	85
Introduction .....	85
Regulating Water Quality in a Changing Delta.....	87
Anticipating Increased Risks of Levee Failures.....	90
Including Upstream Diverters in a Delta Solution .....	91
Protecting Endangered Species in the Face of Uncertainty.....	93
Governance Safeguards for a Peripheral Canal.....	95
Governance and Decisionmaking for a New Delta.....	98
Conclusion.....	99
8. DECISION ANALYSIS FOR DELTA EXPORTS.....	101
Introduction .....	101
Decision Analysis Applied to the Delta Export Alternatives .....	102
Information Needed for Decision Analysis.....	104
Comparing the Water Export Alternatives .....	106
Implementation Issues.....	110
The Timing of Delta Decisions and Consequences.....	111
Conclusions.....	112
9. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS .....	115
Conclusions.....	115
The Changing Delta Landscape.....	115
Fish and the Delta Ecosystem .....	116
Long-Term Water Export Alternatives .....	118
Governance, Regulation, and Finance .....	120
Recommendations.....	123
Charting a Strategic Direction for Water Exports.....	123
Preparing for the Changing Delta Ecosystem.....	125
Managing Delta Levees and Land Use.....	127
Making Decisions and Regulating the New Delta.....	127
Charting the Future for a Changing Delta.....	129
Guide to Online Technical Appendices.....	131
References .....	135
About the Authors.....	143
Related PPIC Publications.....	147